Plasticity of Language-Related Brain Function During Recovery From Stroke

Keith R. Thulborn, MD, PhD; Patricia A. Carpenter, PhD; Marcel A. Just, PhD

Background and Purpose—This study was undertaken to correlate functional recovery from aphasia after acute stroke with the temporal evolution of the anatomic, physiological, and functional changes as measured by MRI.

Methods—Blood oxygenation level–dependent contrast and echo-planar MRI were used to map language comprehension in 6 normal adults and in 2 adult patients during recovery from acute stroke presenting with aphasia. Perfusion, diffusion, sodium, and conventional anatomic MRI were used to follow physiological and structural changes.

Results—The normal activation pattern for language comprehension showed activation predominately in left-sided Wernicke’s and Broca’s areas, with laterality ratios of 0.8 and 0.3, respectively. Recovery of the patient confirmed as having a completed stroke affecting Broca’s area occurred rapidly with a shift of activation to the homologous region in the right hemisphere within 3 days, with continued rightward lateralization over 6 months. In the second patient, in whom mapping was performed fortuitously before stroke, recovery of a Wernicke’s aphasia showed a similar increasing rightward shift in activation recruitment over 9 months after the event.

Conclusions—Recovery of aphasia in adults can occur rapidly and is concomitant with an activation pattern that changes from left to a homologous right hemispheric pattern. Such recovery occurs even when the stroke evolves to completion. Such plasticity must be considered when evaluating stroke interventions based on behavioral and neurological measurements. (Stroke. 1999;30:749-754.)

Key Words: magnetic resonance imaging ■ aphasia ■ cerebral infarction ■ stroke outcome

The development of language in right-handed and most left-handed subjects involves many areas of the brain, including the superior temporal (Wernicke’s area) and inferior frontal (Broca’s area) gyri of the left hemisphere. This view derives from many sources, including lesion studies and Wada tests. Although knowledge of language processing during development remains rudimentary, the left hemispheric regions are believed to dominate language comprehension early in the process. If the left hemisphere becomes dysfunctional during development, neuroplasticity allows homologous regions in the right hemisphere to perform the same processes. Recent neuroimaging studies with positron emission tomography (PET) of adult patients recovered from aphasia after left-hemisphere stroke have demonstrated right-sided activation for language processing. Similar results were reported for adult patients recovered from auditory agnosia. Functional recovery appears to be connected to activation of homologous regions of the contralateral hemisphere. Although some ipsilateral activation may also aid recovery, the possible bilateral representation before stroke has been raised as a possible explanation. Such previous studies were completed well after recovery from the clinical symptoms, leaving the temporal course of such changes uncharted.

Functional MRI (fMRI), a noninvasive method of measuring human brain function during cognition, has shown that a network of cortical areas contributes to language processing. For example, the difficulty of language comprehension during reading has been demonstrated to correlate with the degree of cortical activation. This association between task difficulty and fMRI activation has been generalized to other tasks including visuospatial processing. This reading comprehension also includes brain activation associated with eye movement. Such cognitive paradigms are now being used to map eloquent cortical areas before surgical treatment of epilepsy. Such methodology allows the network of brain areas to be characterized not simply by network locations but also in terms of workload distribution between each location.

A modified simple sentence–reading paradigm for fMRI has been standardized in a group of normal subjects. Two separate clinical cases have been studied with fMRI to show the changes in activation patterns during the first months of the recovery period from stroke involving either Broca’s area or Wernicke’s area. The first patient with acute onset of expressive aphasia from left middle cerebral artery (MCA) stroke showed rapid recovery over the first few days. Although normal controls are useful, the question of language...
representation in a patient before stroke requires a study of the
rare patient who has been mapped before stroke. The second
patient was examined before and after stroke suffered
during surgery for left temporal lobe epilepsy. The implica-
tions of these neuroimaging results are discussed in terms of
recovered brain function and plasticity of large-scale
networks.5,15,16

Subjects and Methods
Informed consent followed the guidelines of the Institutional Review
Board.

Control Group
Six healthy right-handed male college graduates (aged 26 to 31
years) served as control subjects.

Case 1
The patient was a 45-year-old right-handed man, on chronic antico-
agulation medication for aortic valve replacement 7 years previously.
He was a high school graduate with additional technical school
training. He presented to medical attention with abrupt onset of a
dense expressive aphasia and right-sided weakness. A left MCA
stroke was suspected. Emergency CT showed no cerebral hemor-
rhage. Intravenous tissue plasminogen activator (tPA) was initiated
within 3 hours of onset of symptoms. An MRI study was performed
at 5 hours after onset of symptoms and more than 2 hours after
commencement of thrombolytic therapy. Diffusion imaging con-
firmed the left MCA stroke, and perfusion imaging demonstrated
persistent arterial occlusion. The patient recovered considerable
language function over the next 3 days. Another comprehensive
fMRI examination was performed at 76 hours and again at 6 months,
by which time minor word-finding difficulties and a slight balance
impairment were the only symptoms.

Case 2
The patient was a 34-year-old right-handed male college graduate
with chronic epilepsy since sustaining a left-sided closed head injury
at age 11 years. He had been poorly maintained on antiepileptic
medication because of adverse effects. A CT examination demon-
strated focal cortical calcification in the mid left superior temporal
gyrus. When surgical intervention was contemplated to control his
seizures to avoid the use of medications, fMRI using the language
paradigm was performed before surgical placement of grid elec-
trodes for cortical recording. Agreement between fMRI and cortical
grid mapping was excellent, with Wernicke’s area being placed
about 2 centimeters posterior to the well-defined localized lesion in
the left temporal lobe. The patient proceeded to surgery with limited
resection of the small focal region of calcifications but not extending
posteriorly into the area of language function documented by cortical
electrodes. He awoke with a dense receptive aphasia. Functional
MRI studies at 3 and 9 months, during which time language
comprehension skills improved, were compared with the preopera-
tive study. The pathology of the resected tissue diagnosed a gangli-
glioma. The patient returned to work but still acknowledges having
language difficulties since his surgery.

Imaging Protocol
All fMRI imaging was performed with a commercial quadrature
head coil on either a 1.5- or 3.0-T whole-body scanner equipped
with echo-planar imaging and large data-handling capabilities.8,9,13

The comprehensive MRI protocol for patient studies, involving
anatomic, diffusion, perfusion, and sodium imaging, has been
reported elsewhere.18

Acquisition parameters for fMRI using gradient-echo echo-planar
imaging at 3.0 T were as follows: TR=4000 ms; TE=23 ms; field of
view (FOV), 40x20; voxel size, 3.1x3.1x3.0 mm²; slice thickness/gap,
3/1 mm; and n=18 slices. The 1.5-T parameters differed only in
that TE was 50 ms and slice thickness was 5 mm.

The language comprehension paradigm8,10 consisted of 5 cycles of 2
conditions: (1) central fixation (rest condition, 30 s); and (2) silently reading simple sentences (mean length, 5.5 words) each
followed by a question requiring a “true” or “false” answer indicated
by pushing of 1 or 2 finger switches (sentence condition, 30 s). The
accuracy of responses (at least 79% in each session) to the compre-
hension questions assured that the patients were performing the
required task. An additional condition, silent reading of word strings,
is not reported because it produced similar results to the sentence-
reading condition but provided no assurance of comprehension
processing. This paradigm was chosen because it activates both
Broca’s and Wernicke’s areas and can be used to detect changes in
both expressive and receptive aphasias.

The fMRI data were analyzed using customized software,13,19
resulting in a 2-tailed paired t test comparison of the rest and active
conditions of the paradigm for each voxel. The t test is a conservative
statistical approach to analysis of fMRI data and emphasizes the
most robust responses within the data. The volume of each activated
region for each subject was measured as the number of voxels
exceeding the chosen threshold (t>3.0). This threshold minimized
the number of randomly activated voxels while maximizing the
number of reproducibly activated voxels for the subjects of the
normal group. Higher thresholds did not change the patterns of
activations, only decreasing the number of reproducibly activated
voxels. Head motion was assessed by visual inspection of the images
presented in a closed display loop. Three-dimensional display of the
functional data was performed with software called AFNI19 to ensure
that regions were appropriately labeled according to Talairach
coordinates.9 From our previous experience with eye movement13
and language10 paradigms in normal subjects, the areas of activation
are Broca’s area, Wernicke’s area, supplementary eye fields, supe-
rior and inferior frontal eye fields, intraparietal sulcus, visual cortex,
and prefrontal cortex. By counting the number of voxels in each
region of interest, volumes of activation were determined. These
volumes allowed hemispheric asymmetries to be expressed as the
laterality ratio (LR) for each area: LR=(left−right)/(left+right),
where LR equal to 1, 0, or −1 shows that activation is only in the left
hemisphere, symmetrically distributed, or restricted to the right
hemisphere, respectively.

Results

Normal Reading Comprehension
Figure 1 shows a representative activation map for the control
subjects that identifies 8 regions bilaterally. This activation
pattern represents a large-scale network15,16 that includes the
2 main language areas, Wernicke’s and Broca’s areas, which
show left-sided asymmetry, irrespective of right- or left-
handedness, as expected for adult language comprehension.1,5
The Table provides the means and standard deviations of these
laterality ratios (LR) for these areas, showing that the
asymmetry is particularly marked for Wernicke’s area (LR,
0.8±0.3) and less so for Broca’s area (LR, 0.4±0.4). By
contrast, the activation associated with eye movement (supe-
rrior frontal eye fields, inferior frontal eye fields, and intrapa-
rietral sulcus) showed laterality ratios close to 0, indicating
bilateral symmetry.

Case 1

Structural Analysis
Selected anatomic, physiological, and metabolic images from
the first (5 hours), second (76 hours), and third (6 months)
MRI examinations after the abrupt onset of a dense expres-
sive aphasia are shown in Figure 2. Although the T2-
weighted image shows little change acutely (Figure 2a), an
extensive cortical region of signal hyperintensity was present
on diffusion-weighted imaging (Figure 2b) that showed a reduced apparent diffusion coefficient (ADC [lesion], \(0.58 \pm 0.09 \times 10^{-3} \text{ mm}^2/\text{s}\); ADC [normal gray matter], \(0.97 \pm 0.09 \times 10^{-3} \text{ mm}^2/\text{s}\)) from normal gray matter. Acutely, there was a persistent perfusion defect with prolonged tissue transit time (TTT [lesion], 20 s; TTT [contralateral], 10 s). The tissue sodium image showed little change between the tissue sodium concentration of 45 mmol/L in the lesion and that on the contralateral side (Figure 2c). The subject was unable to perform the language paradigm during this examination at 5 hours after the event.

By 76 hours, considerable clinical recovery from the initial aphasia had occurred. The spin-echo images show markedly T2-hyperintense cortex along the left Sylvian fissure (Figure 2d) whereas little change occurred to the region of hyperintense signal on the diffusion-weighted imaging (Figure 2e), except for further reduction in ADC (ADC [lesion], \(0.47 \pm 0.05 \times 10^{-3} \text{ mm}^2/\text{s}\); ADC [contralateral], \(0.97 \pm 0.2 \times 10^{-3} \text{ mm}^2/\text{s}\)). The sodium image (Figure 2f) showed increased TSC (TSC [lesion], 70 mmol/L; TSC [contralateral], 44 mmol/L) over an extensive area encompassing the abnormal ADC.

Selected images from the third MRI examination at 6 months after stroke, by which time the patient had only a few word-finding difficulties, are shown in Figures 2g, 2h, and 2i. The spin-echo images show markedly T2-hyperintense encephalomalacic change along the left Sylvian fissure and left inferior frontal region (Figure 2g). The region of signal hyperintensity on the diffusion-weighted imaging (Figure 2h) showed increased ADC as expected with old stroke (ADC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Brain Area</th>
<th>Control Subjects</th>
<th>Case 1 76 hours</th>
<th>Case 1 6 months</th>
<th>Case 2 Before Stroke</th>
<th>Case 2 3 mo</th>
<th>Case 2 9 mo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wernicke’s area</td>
<td>0.8 ± 0.3</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>−0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broca’s area</td>
<td>0.4 ± 0.4</td>
<td>−0.8</td>
<td>−1.0</td>
<td>−0.2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
fMRI Analysis

The significant clinical recovery of patient 1 permitted fMRI studies with language to be performed at 76 hours and at 6 months, as shown in Figures 3a and 3b, respectively. The fMRI results show that this right-handed subject had an abnormal laterality ratio for Broca’s area by 76 hours, showing strong right dominance, in contrast to the normal left dominance. By 6 months, this abnormal cerebral dominance pattern progressed to being totally right-sided. Wernicke’s area remained strongly left dominant at 6 months. The changes involving several areas measured at 2 times support the hypothesis that clinical recovery was associated with rapid redistribution of the task over an existing large-scale network to allow rapid initial recovery within days, followed by consolidation of the new pattern over subsequent months. No new nodes of activation other than those observed in normal subjects were identified. Activation in areas related to eye movement were normal, indicating that not all of the areas activated during sentence reading had been disturbed by the lesion.

Case 2

Structural Analysis

Selected anatomic MR images before and at 3 months after stroke with resultant receptive aphasia are shown in Figure 4. Initially (Figure 4a and 4b), the epileptic lesion in the left temporal lobe was a focal region of hypointensity on T1- and T2-weighted images. At 3 months, an extensive cortical region of signal hyperintensity with encephalomalacia was present on T2-weighted images (Figure 4c). This corresponded to a T1-hypointense region (Figure 4d) consistent with stroke. Differential damage to white matter surrounding the lateral angle of the frontal horn of the lateral ventricle and of the isthmus of the left temporal lobe have been related to the differential rates of recovery. The lateral angle was spared in patient 1, indicating that cingulate-supplementary motor area connections to the caudate nucleus were intact. In contrast, the isthmus of the left temporal lobe of patient 2 was at least partially involved in the stroke. Thus, patient 2 was confirmed as having a focal stroke in the superior temporal gyrus by anatomic imaging at 3 months after the event, during which time progressive recovery had occurred.

fMRI Analysis

The fortuitous availability of pre-event fMRI data from this subject afforded a rare glimpse of a documented shift in the hemispheric dominance after stroke. At 3 and 9 months, the subject participated in the same fMRI language study as used before surgery. The activation maps from these studies are shown in Figure 5. The laterality ratio of Wernicke’s area changed progressively from strong left hemisphere dominance before the event to weak right dominance after 3 months and considerable right hemisphere dominance by 9 months. Although the stroke did not involve Broca’s area, there was a slight shift from weak right dominance before the event to weak left dominance by 9 months. In general, the large-scale network seemed to be reestablishing function in an interactive way among its member nodes. No new regions of activation other than those observed in normal subjects were identified. Activation in the areas related to eye movement were normal, indicating again that not all of the areas

Figure 3. Activation maps of patient 1 at (a) 76 hours and (b) 6 months using the same paradigm and activation labels as in Figure 1.

Figure 4. Images of patient 2 documenting the left-sided epileptic focus (arrow) before surgery (upper row) and after the stroke (arrow) at 3 months follow-up (lower row) using representative slices of T2-weighted images (a, c) and diffusion-weighted images (b, d).
activated during sentence reading were disturbed by the lesion. These observations support the hypothesis that recovery was associated with a redistribution of workload over the existing large-scale network, with consolidation occurring over many months.

**Discussion**

Because language function, like other higher level cognitive processes, is subserved by multiple brain areas, focal brain damage and subsequent recovery constitute a change to the large-scale network supporting such cognition. In the case of patient 2, with a long standing underlying disease process that may have influenced the development and maturation of the language network, we caution that this pattern of redistribution may not generalize to recovery patterns of patients with simple acute embolic stroke. However, the observations are that when a key node of a large-scale cortical network is damaged by a stroke, undamaged network components (namely, contralateral homologs) are increasingly recruited to increase their workload. Hence, as the workload of the remaining network is modified, a shift in cognitive workload can occur toward the contralateral hemisphere. There may also exist other patterns of compensatory cortical activation that have been observed in chronic patients years after stroke, such as increased activation in areas immediately adjacent to the lesion. Any of these long-term adaptations of a network constitutes a form of plasticity that is associated with recovery of language function after brain damage.

The contribution of fMRI to the understanding of such phenomena is its ability to measure and characterize the activity of a large-scale cortical network and to noninvasively monitor any changes in its organization during the course of spontaneous or intervention-based recovery from stroke. The language paradigm used for these cases is a particularly useful one in that abnormal activation patterns were detected for both expressive and receptive aphasias. The evaluation of the effects of therapies to promote recovery from stroke, whether they be pharmacological, surgical, or behavioral, can be guided by functional neuroimaging.

Involvement of contralateral areas of the brain after stroke in adults has been documented previously in aphasia recovery weeks after the event at low spatial resolution by cortical DC potential changes and in motor output recovery weeks to months after the event by magnetic transcranial stimulation, blood flow responses, and motor-evoked responses. The PET studies performed months to years after recovery. The current study demonstrates a spontaneous redistribution of function to the right hemisphere that occurred within days and continued over months as performance normalized during recovery from aphasia. The results indicate the organizational flexibility of the cortical systems that underlie higher-level function. This information may be useful in designing future rehabilitation strategies that can exploit this flexibility. Given that even the adult has mechanisms of plasticity that can produce rapid functional recovery despite the evolution of infarction, functional neuroimaging is essential for distinguishing the success of acute stroke interventions from these innate compensatory mechanisms.

**Acknowledgments**

The authors acknowledge financial support from Public Health Service grants PHS-PO1-NS35949 and PHS-ROI-CA63661; National Institute of Mental Health Scientist Awards MH-00661 and MH-00662; and General Electric Medical Systems.

**References**


Plasticity of Language-Related Brain Function During Recovery From Stroke
Keith R. Thulborn, Patricia A. Carpenter and Marcel A. Just

Stroke. 1999;30:749-754
doi: 10.1161/01.STR.30.4.749

The online version of this article, along with updated information and services, is located on the World Wide Web at:
http://stroke.ahajournals.org/content/30/4/749

Permissions: Requests for permissions to reproduce figures, tables, or portions of articles originally published in Stroke can be obtained via RightsLink, a service of the Copyright Clearance Center, not the Editorial Office. Once the online version of the published article for which permission is being requested is located, click Request Permissions in the middle column of the Web page under Services. Further information about this process is available in the Permissions and Rights Question and Answer document.

Reprints: Information about reprints can be found online at:
http://www.lww.com/reprints

Subscriptions: Information about subscribing to Stroke is online at:
http://stroke.ahajournals.org//subscriptions/